

http://doi.org/10.62405/osi.2024.01.04 UDC 001.8

# PROBLEMS OF BIBLIOGRAPHICAL MANAGERS FOR SCIENCE AUTOMATIZATION: APPROACH TO SOLVE AND ONTOLOGICAL VIEWPOINT

#### Maryna Shapovalova,

State Scientific and Technical Library of Ukraine

#### Viktor Shapovalov,

State Scientific and Technical Library of Ukraine

#### Yevhenii Shapovalov,

State Scientific and Technical Library of Ukraine

**Abstract.** This paper explores the functionalities and limitations of major reference manager systems, focusing on their role in solving the author identification problem in academic research. It critically analyzes the features of popular reference managers like Zotero, EndNote, Mendeley, SciWheel, and Paperpile, assessing their capabilities in reference management and their approaches to author identification. The study reveals that while these systems offer robust reference management functionalities, including citation generation, bibliography management, and collaborative tools, they fail to integrate advanced author identification mechanisms, such as ORCID. The lack of such features highlights a significant gap in current reference management solutions, impacting the accuracy and efficiency of scholarly communication. The paper emphasizes the need for enhanced features in reference management principles. This study contributes to the understanding of current limitations in reference management of developing advanced features for accurate author attribution in the digital era of academic research. It focuses on using additional integrational data about the authors by using ORCID as the main identifier. This solution is crucial for countries with non-Latin alphabet, including Cyrillic.

*Keywords:* Open Science; FAIR Principles; Reference Managers; Author Identification; Digital Identifiers; Ontological Tools.

#### **1. INTRODUCTION**

The automation of processes is increasingly ubiquitous and necessary in contemporary contexts. This trend encompasses the efficient collection and processing of data. Notably, Big Data mining and cognitive ontology technologies are gaining traction due to their effectiveness in facilitating decision-making processes (Stryzhak et al., 2021; Stryzhak, 2020). The significance of data in the realm of automation is manifold, playing a pivotal role in revolutionizing the practices of data scientists (De Bie et al., 2021) and enabling the automation of data analytical processes via semantic technologies (Bednar et al., 2022). In automotive production, for instance, data-driven models are utilized for predictive maintenance and condition monitoring, with anomaly detection emerging as a significant challenge (Dierkes et al., 2021). Collectively, these studies underscore the vital role of data in propelling automation across diverse sectors.

This paradigm is equally pertinent in the scientific domain. Open Science, a movement striving for greater transparency and reproducibility in research, encompasses elements such as open access, open data, and open-source software (Méndez Fernández et al., 2019). Defined as a collaborative culture fostered by technology, it promotes the sharing of data, information, and knowledge within the scientific community and the wider public (Ramachandran et al.,

2021). This openly shared and collaboratively developed knowledge, facilitated through networks, enhances accessibility and transparency (Vicente-Saez & Martinez-Fuentes, 2018). The importance of data programs in fostering and expediting open science is also highlighted (Ramachandran et al., 2021).

The scientific community has adopted the FAIR principles — Findable, Accessible, Interoperable, and Reusable-for research data (Wilkinson et al., 2016). The FAIR framework, focusing on data openness, is integral to Open Science (Chukanova, 2022). In the Facility for Antiproton and Ion Research (FAIR) context, these principles are set to substantially advance knowledge in areas including fundamental interactions, nuclear astrophysics, and materials research (Durante et al., 2019). It is used in different specific fields as well as generally in science. For example, in geoscientific modeling, the FAIR principles are applied to ensure that research data and software are accessible and reproducible, thus enhancing collaboration and knowledge dissemination (Hut, 2022).

A specific challenge in implementing Open Science and adhering to FAIR principles is the identification of scientists and establishing links between them and their publications. Utilizing IT tools appears is a viable solution to this challenge. Bibliographical managers serve as a database for publications. These reference managers are indispensable for researchers, offering a centralized platform for organizing, annotating, and referencing literature (Meade et al., 2023). They streamline the process of generating citations and bibliographies and can be adapted to meet specific journal requirements (Meade et al., 2023). Popular reference managers such as EndNote, Zotero, Mendeley, and Paperpile each possess unique features and limitations (Meade et al., 2023). These tools have evolved to support a variety of functions, including managing PDFs, annotating, and searching for references (Francavilla, 2018). They are beneficial for learning, teaching, and writing, thereby proving invaluable for both researchers and educators (Francavilla, 2018). They could be pivotal in automating the data related to publications and authors. Key functions include treating authors as separate entities and merging author profiles. However, challenges arise with the variation in author metadata formats. such as different forms of last names or combinations of last names and initials. A potential solution lies in using identifiers like ORCID, although this feature is currently absent in popular reference managers. This issue is particularly relevant in non-Latin alphabet-using countries, where authors often publish in English to maximize impact. Many Slovak authors have explored and highlighted this issue. latsyshyn et al. (2021) addresses the challenges of author identification and the application of digital technologies in the scientific community, emphasizing the role of digital identifiers and global communication systems in shaping scientific identity. Roy (2020) contributes to this area by developing a framework for linking citing and cited sentences in research articles using deep learning models (Singha Roy et al., 2020). These studies collectively underscore the criticality of digital technologies, deep learning, and philosophical methodologies in resolving issues related to author identification and scholarly publication.

Therefore, **this paper aims** to explore the potential of using personal accounts of reference managers to store and process data, particularly in addressing authorization issues. To achieve this objective, the **following research questions** are investigated:

What is the current state of the most popular reference managers and their features?

What are the main challenges that reference managers face in integrating and calculating data?

What are the potential solutions to these challenges?

# 2. METHODOLOGY

Literature Review. A comprehensive literature review is conducted to establish a foundational understanding of the current state of reference managers and their features. We were focused on identifying relevant academic papers, technical reports, and industry publications that discuss the evolution, capabilities, and



limitations of reference managers such as End-Note, Zotero, Mendeley, and Paperpile. Special attention is given to studies that address issues of author metadata formats and the integration of digital identifiers like ORCID. Additionally, literature on the FAIR principles, Open Science, and the role of data in scientific research was analyzed to contextualize the study within the broader field of scientific data management.

Analysis of the interfaces and functions. An empirical analysis of the interfaces and functions of the most popular reference managers is performed. This step involves a hands-on examination of each reference manager to document their features, user interface design, and functional capabilities. Key aspects such as citation generation, bibliography management, PDF management, annotation capabilities, and reference searching efficiency are evaluated. The analysis also examined how these tools manage author identification and data integration, especially in the context of non-Latin alphabet usage. The reference managers EndNote, Zotero, and Mendeley were analyzed as the most popular tools and sciwheel.

**Defining the Problems.** Based on the insights gained from the literature review and interface analysis, the key problems and challenges faced by reference managers is defined. This includes issues related to data integration, author identification, inconsistent metadata formats, and lack of support for digital identifiers. The impact of these problems on researchers, especially in the context of Open Science and adherence to FAIR principles are highlighted. This phase also involved identifying gaps in current functionalities that hinder efficient data management and author attribution.

**Proposing Solutions.** Building on the identified problems, this section proposes potential solutions to address the challenges faced by reference managers. Solutions are grounded in the findings from the literature review and analysis of current tools. This could include recommendations for the integration of digital identifiers like ORCID, enhancements in metadata handling, and improvements in user interface design for better accessibility and usability. The feasibility of implementing these solutions, along with their potential impact on improving the efficiency and effectiveness of research data management, is discussed.

### **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

# **3.1. Analysis of the interfaces and functions and Defining the Problems**

Zotero, a free and open-source reference manager, offers a user-friendly platform for researchers to collect, organize, and cite diverse research materials. Compatible with Windows, macOS, Linux, and web interfaces, it supports various data types and integrates smoothly with word processors for easy citation and bibliography generation. Unique features include robust PDF management and social networking capabilities for collaborative research (see Fig. 1). Despite its comprehensive functionality, Zotero remains intuitive and accessible, catering to the needs of a diverse academic audience.

EndNote is a professional reference management software catering primarily to researchers and academics. It provides efficient tools for organizing references, creating bibliographies, and managing research documents. Compatible with Windows and macOS, EndNote integrates well with Microsoft Word, facilitating smooth citation and bibliography generation in various styles. Although it is a paid tool, its advanced features, like PDF annotation and direct import of references from databases, make it a valuable resource for serious researchers (see Fig. 2). EndNote's limitation to desktop platforms is counterbalanced by its robust data handling and organizational capabilities.

Mendeley is a versatile reference manager that combines bibliographic data organization with academic social networking. Available on Windows, macOS, and through a web interface, it offers free basic access with options for paid storage upgrades. Mendeley stands out for its PDF annotation capabilities and its ability to facilitate collaboration through shared libraries (see Fig. 3). Its integration with Microsoft Word and other word processors enables easy citation management across various styles. Mendeley's user-friendly interface, designed for both individual

#### SHAPOVALOVA MARYNA, SHAPOVALOV VIKTOR, SHAPOVALOV YEVHENII PROBLEMS OF BIBLIOGRAPHICAL MANAGERS FOR SCIENCE AUTOMATIZATION: APPROACH TO SOLVE AND ONTOLOGICAL VIEWPOINT

1 *			> All Fields or
y Library	Title	Creator	
My Collection	> 📄 1National University of Food Technologies, Ukraine, Kyiv, 68 Volodimirska S t., e-mail: salyuk@i.ua 2 National University of Food Technologies, Ukraine	Salyuk	
My Collection 7/5/2022, 1:31:44 PM	> 📃 A semantic structuring of educational research using ontologies	Shapovalov et al.	
Semerikov	> A Taxonomic Representation of Scientific Studies	Shapovalov and Shapovalov	
Untitled	🛃 adaptive Ye. Shannotated.pdf		
Untitled 1	📕 Ahmed et al 2019 - Large-scale application of iron-containing mineral resources in environmental engineering(4)-annotated.pdf		
My Publications	Analyzing of main trends of STEM education in Ukraine using stemua.science statistics	Shapovalov et al.	
Duplicate Items	Is Assessment of mobile phone applications feasibility on plant recognition: comparison with Google Lens AR-app	Bilyk et al.	
Unfiled Items	Bilyk et al 2019 - The scientific, engineering methods and their integration as part of STEM education. The practical guide(5)-annotated.pdf		
Trash	Bilyk et al 2019 - The scientific, engineering methods and their integration as part of STEM education. The practical guide(6)-annotated.pdf		
	Bilyk et al 2019 - Use of ontological resources of the universal network information educational media for STEMSTEAM-lessons(11)-annotated.pdf		
	Bilyk et al 2019 - Ose of ontological resources of the universal network information educational media for STEMSTEAM-lessons(1)-annotated.pdf		
	Big et al. 2019 - Ose of ontological resources of the universal network information educational media for stewistexwi-lessons(12)-annotated.put      [5] Centralized information web-oriented educational environment of Ukraine	Shapovalov et al.	
		•	
	Comparative analysis of the normative frameworks in the EU and Ukraine for water protection	National University of Food Technology et al.	
	🔉 🛃 Comparing Google Lens Recognition Accuracy with Other Plant Recognition Apps:	Bilyk et al.	
	COMPARISON OF EU AND UKRAINE REGULATORY FRAMEWORK FOR BIOGAS PRODUCTION	Shapovalov et al.	
	E Comparison of ontology with non-ontology tools for educational research	Tarasenko et al.	
	Development of an ammonia production method for carbon-free energy generation	Zhadan et al.	
	> 📄 Dry Anaerobic Digestion of Chicken Manure: A Review	Shapovalov et al.	
	> 📄 Healthy lifestyle behaviors among university students in Ukraine	National University of Food Technologies, Kyiv et al.	
	> 📄 INVESTIGATION OF MIGRATION OF HEAVY METALS IN THE SOIL ENVIRONMENT ON THE EXAMPLE OF COPPER SULFATE	Lyuta et al.	
	> 📄 Iron-containing clay and hematite iron ore in slurry-phase anaerobic digestion of chicken manure	lvanov et al.	
	📆 Kotinskiy et al 2019 - The effect of exogenous organic substances on spirulina growth(2)-annotated.pdf		
	> 📄 METHANE FERMENTATION OF CHICKEN MANURE UNDER CONDITIONS OF REDUCED CONCENTRATION OF INHIBITORS	Salyuk et al.	
	> 🔗 Method of alkaline destruction as the way to stop methanogenic effluent's gasification	Tarasenko et al.	
	> 🗎 [No title found]		
	> 🖹 Ontological information system for the selection of technologies for the treatment and disposal of organic waste: engineering and educational aspects	Shapovalov et al.	
	>  Ontology based systemazing of the science information devoted to waste utilizing by methanogenesys	Shapovalov et al.	
	Ontology-based learning environment model of scientific studies	Tarasenko et al.	
	In Ontology-Based Systemizing of the Science Information Devoted to Waste Utilizing by Methanogenesis	Shapovalov et al.	
	Production of mineral feed supplement-annotated.pdf		
	⇒ ■ REGULATION OF THE AMMONIA NITROGEN CONCENTRATION AT THE METHANE FERMENTATION OF CHICKEN MANURE UNDER CONDITIONS OF T	Shapovalov et al.	
	REGULATION OF THE AMMONIA NITROGEN CONCENTRATION AT THE METHANE FERMENTATION OF CHICKEN MANURE UNDER CONDITIONS OF T	Shapovalov et al.	
	<ul> <li>Reduction of the Animonia Mandoler Concernation of the Animonia Concernation of the Animonia Mandole Concern</li></ul>	Shapovalov et al.	
	Salyuk, Zhadan, Shapovalov - 2016 - Biogas production from chicken manure under reduced concentration of inhibitors(3)-annotated.pdf		
	🟃 Sergey Zhadan, Artem Dyba, Yevhenii Shapovalov, Andrey Kotinsky - 2021 - Decalcification of anaerobically treated effluent of yeast f(3)-annotated.pdf		
	📜 Shapovalov et al 2017 - Інформаційні онтологічні інструменти для забезпечення дослідницького підходу в STEM-навчанні (Information (5)-ап		
	🛃 Shapovalov et al 2017 - Інформаційні онтологічні інструменти для забезпечення дослідницького підходу в STEM-навчанні (Information (6)-ап		
	🛃 Shapovalov et al 2021 - Development of the digital register system as a factor of providing Low Touch Economy and Sustainable Deve(2)-annotated		
	🛃 Shapovalov et al 2021 - Using of computer game Civilization as stem-project(4)-annotated.pdf		
	🛃 Shapovalov, Bilyk, Shapovalov - 2021 - Systematical overview of Google Lens efficiency during STEM classes-annotated.pdf		
	🛃 Shapovalov, Bilyk, Shapovalov - 2021 - Systematical overview of Google Lens efficiency during STEM classes(2)-annotated.pdf		
	🔀 Shapovalov, Salyuk - 2018 - The liquid phase recirculation under methanogenic fermentation of chicken manure(11)-annotated.pdf		
	👎 Shapovalov, Salyuk - 2018 - The liquid phase recirculation under methanogenic fermentation of chicken manure(12)-annotated.pdf		
No tags to display	🛼 Shapovalov, Tarasenko, Usenko - 2021 - CIT Polyhedron as tool to systemize STEM content(3)-annotated.pdf		
	\sum Shapovalov, Tarasenko, Usenko - 2021 - CIT Polyhedron as tool to systemize STEM content(4)-annotated.pdf		
	Structuring Augmented Reality Information on the stemua.science	Shapovalov et al.	
	Structuring Augmented Reality Information on the stemua.science	Shapovalov et al.	



© Clarivate EndNote Search	ı							English ∽ Q ⊖ rick.meyler@clarivate.com ∽				
MY LIBRARY	к	Ê	All	refe	erences			I< Grothe, 2000 < > ×				
All references	196	0		÷	Da 17 📋			Summary Edit File Attachments				
🗊 Trash	9			ß	Authors	Year	Title	Structure and function of the bat superior olivary				
Unfiled	11				Pepperberg, I. M.	1993	COMMUNICA	complex				
MY GROUPS	+		=		Pepperberg, I. M.	1990	REFERENTIA					
🕾 New Group	0		=		Avila-Flores, R.; Medellin	2004	Ecological, ta	Microsc Res Tech a 2000				
> Avian Intelligence	46		-		Aizpurua, O.; Alberdi, A.;	2016	Fishing Techr	Volume 51 Issue 4 Pages 382-402				
> Bats	31		=		Grothe, B.; Park, T. J.	2000	Structure and					
> My Groups	133		-		Pepperberg, I. M.	1986	SENSITIVE F	11071721 F				
			=		Pepperberg, I. M.	2004	Evolution of c	c https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/11071721				
Terms of use			=		Teeling, E. C.; Springer,	2005	A molecular p	The superior olivary complex (SOC) is a mammalian auditory brainstem structure that contains several nuclei. Some of them are part of the ascending				
Privacy Policy			=		Pepperberg, I. M.	2006	Cognitive and					
			=		Pepperberg, I. M.	1984	COGNITION.	Citation style				
		П	-		Blanco, G.; Cuevas, J. A	2019	A shot in the o					

Fig. 2. Interface of endnote

researchers and collaborative groups, makes it a popular choice in the academic community.

SciWheel is a web-based reference manager offering features like instant reference saving from the web, including Google Scholar and PubMed. Users can highlight and add notes to PDFs and web pages (see Fig. 4), access references and PDFs from any device, and utilize



	0			Q - Search	Yevhenii 🕻
idd Folders Sync	Help				
Library 3	My Publications Edit Settings				_
B Recently Added	🖈 🔍 🖻 Authors	Title	Year Published In	Added	Details Notes Contents
Recently Read	<ul> <li>Вілик, Жанна Іванівна; Шаповалов, Віктор Бо Шаповалов, Євгеній Борисович</li> </ul>		2023 Збірник матеріалів V Всеукраїнського відкритого на	Ci4 9	
Needs Review	🐇 🔹 Shapovavlov, Yevenii Boris; Shapovalov, Viktor	Boris Enhancing Student Motivation in Science Education Through Effective Communication and Innovative Strategies	2023 Збірник матеріалів V Всеукраїнського відкритого на	Civ 9	
My Publications	<ul> <li>Shapovalov, Yevheni Boris; Shapovalov, Viktor Bilyk, Zhanna Ivanovna</li> </ul>	Boris; Leveraging Ontology for Enhanced Conference Management	2023 Збірник матеріалів V Всеукраїнського відкритого на	CH 9	
ammonia	• Shapovalov, Yevhenii Boris	Harnessing Cognitive Services to Elevate Scientific Research: A Case Study of the 'Poliedr-Researcher' Platform	2023 Збірник матеріалів V Всеукраїнського відкритого на	Civi 9	
DNTB FAIR	<ul> <li>Shapovalov, Yevhenii; Shapovalov, Vktor; Tara Roman; Usenko, Stanislav; Paschke, Adrian; Sa</li> </ul>	senko, Structurization and Processing of the Scientific Studies in the Form of Digital Ontologies vchenk	2021 Proceedings of the 2nd Myroslav I. Zhaldak Symposium on Advan	26.12.23	
Fulbright M	<ul> <li>Shapovalov, Vktor B.; Shapovalov, Yevheni B.;</li> <li>Zhanna I.; Megalinska, Anna P.; Muzyka, Ivan G</li> </ul>		2019 Educational Dimension	13.12.23	
Fulbright my Mendeley dasses 13.12	<ul> <li>Рудактова, Т.В.; Шаповалов, Є.Б; Кузнецова Шаповалов, Є.Б.</li> </ul>	э. Т.К.; Відкриті наукові дані: аналітика авропейських та національних стандартів щодо якості, інтероперабельності та безлеки	2023 Scientific notes of Junior Academy of Sciences of Ukraine	13.12.23	
Mendeley problems My publ	<ul> <li>Білик, Жанна Іванівна; Шаповалов, Віктор Бо Шаповалов, Євгеній Борисович</li> </ul>	рисович; Розробка онтологічних засобів підтринки партнерської науково-освітньої діяльності учнів та педагогів	2023 Інноваційні трансформації в сучасній освіті: виклики, реалі	13.12.23	
My publications	Andruszkiewicz, Fabian; Slipukhina, Iryna A.; Shapovalov, Yevhenii Borysovych	Cooperation of the University of Opolska with Scientific and Educational Units of Ukraine in States of Threats: Practical Dimension	2023 Annales Universitatis Mariae Curie- Skłodowska, sectio J – Paedago	13.12.23	
OLd	<ul> <li>Stryzhak, Oleksandr; Gorborukov, Viacheslav; D Stanislav; Prykhodniuk, Vitaliy; Shapovalov, Vikt</li> </ul>		2023 Information and Communication Technologies and Sustainable De	12.12.23	
r2	Yevhenii, Shapovalov	Ensuring educational seekers' motivation during providing STEM in education by using modern IT tools in terms of European integration	2023 The world of innovative opportunities: current issues of	08.12.23	
sertificates	Shapovavlov, Yevenii Boris; Shapovavlov, Vikto	Boris Sustainable Handling of Science Metadata: Optimization Potential and European Integration Context	2023 Proceedings V International Conference European Dimension	07.12.23	-
by Additions	Yakymenko, Ihor Leonidovich; Bublienko, Natalik Salavor, Oksana M.; Shapovalov, Yevhenil Boris		2023 Proceedings V International Conference European Dimension	07.12.23	No documents selected
d, Zubair szkiewicz, Fabian enko, Pavlo	🔸 🔹 Shapovalov, Yevhenii Boris; Shapovalov, Viktor	Boris Sustainable Handling of Science Metadata: Optimization Potential and European Integration Context	2023 Proceedings V International Conference European Dimension	07.12.23	
enko, Pavlo D enko, Pavlo D enko, Pavlo D.	📩 🔹 🛐 Shapovalov, Yevhenii Boris; Shapovalov, Viktor	Boris Current State of Biogas Plants Development in the Ukraine and the Potential to Development During European Integration	2023 Proceedings V International Conference European Dimension	07.12.23	
enko, Pavlo "Pasha" is, Artem Ivanovich	<ul> <li>Shapovalov, Yevheni B; Zakuslo, Oleksander P, Shapovalov, Viktor B; Burba, Oleg I; Pilat, Oleg</li> </ul>		2023 Information and Communication Technologies in Education, Rese	30.11.23	
Zh. I. Zhanna	📩 🔹 🖺 Shapovalov, Y B.; Sipukhina, I. A.; Shapovalov		2023 Journal of Physics: Conference Series	29.11.23	
Zhanna I Zhanna I. Zhanna Ivanovna	Shapovalov, Ye B; Salavor, O M; Yakymenko, Ih Leonidovich		2023 IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science	28.11.23	
ann, Günther nko, Natalia	Shapovalov, Yevheni Boris; Shapovalov, Viktor		2023 Матеріали п'ятої Всеукраїнської науково-практичної конферен	13.11.23	
Oleg I atskiy, Ihor Stanislavovich	<ul> <li>Antonenko, Pavlo "Pasha"; Shapovavlov, Yever Bilyk, Zhanna Ivanovna; Shapovalov, Viktor Bor</li> </ul>		2023 AERA 2023 Annual Meeting	11.10.23	
, Stanislav Marila I		Yevenii The Potential of Green Ammonia Production from Animal Waste in the EU and Ukraine	2023 4th International Multidisciplinary Conference For Young Research	06.10.23	
iczuk-Śródka, Agnieszka Artem Taturcz	Padan, Sergey Oleksandrovich; Zhadan, O.M.     Boris; Salyuk, Anatoliy Ivanovich; Zhadan, O.M.	Yevenii Assessment of Ammonia Production Potential from Animal Waste in Ukraine: A Promising Approach for	2023 4th International Multidisciplinary Conference For Young Research	06.10.23	
n, Tetyana n, Tetyna Irda, Mariia	Ovia, Surjos, Antonin Zvariotici, Zitolari, Site Dovha, Mariia I; Antonenko, Pavlo D; Shapovak Yevhenii Boris; Lytovchenko, Daniil S; Halchenko	ov, Developing and evaluating the effectiveness of a plot online course for creativity development	2023 International Journal of Technology and Design Education	06.10.23	
, Anatoli ukov, Viacheslav	Zhadan, Sergey Oleksandrovich; Shapovalov, Y Boris; Salvuk, Anatoly; Usenko, Stanislav Artur		2023 Bioconversion of Wastes to Value- added Products	31.08.23	
enko, Maksym S	<ul> <li>Білик, Ж. І.; Шаповалов, Є. Б; Шаповалов, В</li> </ul>	Б Розвиток дослідницької компетентності у найбутніх вчителів предмета «Основи здоров'я» із	2023 Scientific notes of Junior Academy	16.08.23	

Fig. 3. Mendeley interface

collaborative tools for sharing and discussing research. SciWheel suggests relevant articles and integrates with Microsoft Word and Google Docs for citation and bibliography generation.

Paperpile is a reference manager tailored for researchers and academics. It offers efficient tools for organizing references, creating bibliographies, and managing research documents. Paperpile is notable for its seamless integration with Google Docs and Google Scholar (see Fig. 5), making it particularly useful for users in the Google ecosystem. It supports a variety of citation styles and is known for its user-friendly interface. Paperpile is a subscription-based service, providing a reliable and streamlined solution for managing and citing academic sources.

	All references Q •
All references	REFERENCES SUGGESTIONS NOTES ACTIVITY MANUSCRIPTS
C Reading list	□ ▼ 0/1 [] RELEVANCE (DESC) ▼ 11 /1 < >
Private projects +	Synchronization competencies provided by traditional educational system with real-life required competencies in
<ul> <li>to review</li> </ul>	Conditions of digital sociality Shapovalov Y, Shapovalov Y, Chapovalov
Your publications	Educ. Technol. Q., 2022 Feb 03
Shared projects +	ABSTRACT V (SCOPUS) (add tag )
<ul> <li>UA-USA Cooperation *</li> </ul>	
Colective Publications	
Creativity	
Google Lens USA-UA	
Private tags	
2014     2021     Agriculture     Augmented reality     Cebrian2220     CEUR     Chemessiy     Coderementation     OTE     DAK	
Digital labs     Dissertation     Ecology	

Fig. 4. Sciwheel interface

Daperpile 🔂 Add Papers 🔻 🖉 Select 🔻 💼 🔻 🍡 Trash 🛛 Edit 🛛 Cite 🔍 Share 💌 Search your papers L ORCID GLeb G 🗙 ALL PAPERS 1 daads 🔶 Paper found FOLDERS ORCID GLeb G 1 shown, 1 selected LABELS nal Article gasf - Jour A SHARED FOLDERS Date Added v Publication Da Title TRASH Journal Author Filter Unsorted (1) Has no PDF (1) Incomplete (1) Type Journal Article (1)

Fig. 5. Paperpile interface

In the realm of reference management software, the landscape is diverse, encompassing both paid and free models. EndNote and Paperpile emerge as paid solutions, offering robust features for a fee. Conversely, Zotero provides a no-cost alternative, albeit with the option of paid upgrades for enhanced storage capabilities. Mendeley and Sciencewheel also offer free basic plans, with advanced features and expanded storage available for a premium. The platform compatibility of these tools exhibits notable variation. Zotero stands out with its broad compatibility, supporting Windows, macOS, Linux, and web interfaces, thereby offering a versatile solution for a wide range of users. EndNote, in contrast, is confined to Windows and macOS platforms, potentially limiting its accessibility to a subset of users.

All the examined reference managers adeptly facilitate in-text citations and the generation of bibliographies across multiple citation styles, catering to diverse academic requirements. EndNote and Paperpile distinguish themselves through their seamless integration with Google Docs, a feature particularly beneficial for users embedded in the Google ecosystem. Zotero and Mendeley extend their functionality beyond mere citation management, incorporating social networking features and mobile application support, thereby enhancing user engagement and accessibility. Sciencewheel introduces a novel approach with its integration of mind maps and visual citation analysis, offering a unique perspective in organizing and visualizing research citations.

#1,2024

The spectrum of collaborative features in these tools varies significantly. EndNote offers basic sharing capabilities, while Paperpile advances the paradigm with features supporting real-time collaboration, a boon for team-based research endeavors. In terms of storage, the landscape is mixed. While all software solutions provide online storage, Zotero and EndNote also facilitate local storage, affording users additional flexibility in data management and accessibility, particularly in environments with limited online connectivity. Table 1 summarizes the key features and differences among the discussed reference managers.

A critical aspect of reference management is author identification. All the discussed tools recognize both ORCID identifiers and conventional name/surname inputs for author identification. The use of ORCID is highly advocated, given its capability to uniquely identify researchers, thereby circumventing issues of ambiguity that are often inherent in name-based identification. Nonetheless, the traditional name/surname approach remains a viable fallback, ensuring inclusivity for users not registered with ORCID or in contexts where such digital identifiers are not prevalently used. This dual approach underscores the adaptability of these tools in accommodating varying user needs and practices in academic research.



Table 1

#### **Comparison of Features in Popular Reference Managers**

Feature	EndNote	Zotero	Mendeley	Paperpile	Sciencewheel		
Reference Import	Supports various file types, web imports, manual entry	Supports various file types, web imports, manual entry, and browser extensions	Supports various file types, web imports, manual entry, and browser extensions	Supports various file types, web imports, manual entry, and Google Scholar integration	Supports PDF and Word imports, manual entry, and browser extensions		
Citation Management	In-text citations and bibliography generation for multiple styles	In-text citations and bibliography generation for multiple styles, note-taking, syncing with online storage	In-text citations and bibliography generation for multiple styles, note-taking, social networking features, syncing with online storage	In-text citations and bibliography generation for multiple styles, Google Docs integration, sharing features	In-text citations and bibliography generation for multiple styles, mind map integration, collaborative features		
Organization	Folders, tags, search, custom fields	Folders, tags, collections, search, notes, attachments	Folders, tags, notebooks, search, annotations, full- text search	Folders, labels, search, Google Drive integration	Folders, tags, search, mind map integration		
Platforms	Windows, macOS	Windows, macOS, Linux, web	Windows, macOS, Linux, iOS, Android, web, desktop	Web-based, Google Chrome extension	Windows, macOS, web		
Cost	Paid, with free trial	Free, with paid storage options	Free basic plan, paid plans for more storage and features	Paid subscription	Paid subscription		
Storage	Local or online	Local or online	Online	Online	Online		
Collaboration	Limited sharing features	Sharing features for groups and projects	Sharing features for groups and projects	Real-time collaboration features	Collaborative features for teams		
Unique Features	Manuscript templates, integration with reference databases	Open-source, customizable, extensive plugin support	Social networking features, mobile apps	Google Docs integration, machine learning-based suggestions	Mind map integration, visual citation analysis		
Integration with Word	Yes	Yes, via plugin	Yes, via plugin	No	No		
Integration with Google Docs	No	Yes, via plugin	No	Yes, native integration	No		
Author Identification (ORCID or manual)	ORCID or other IDs aren't used to identify author						

The most developed system on author identification is Zotero. However, it still doesn't use identifiers such as ORCID to identify the user. However, it just contains an additional field — the role of the author, as shown in Figure 6. This feature is useful but still does not solve the problem with the author's identification.



Fig. 6. Author Role Field in Zotero

Therefore, none of the proposed managers use IDs (such as ORCID) to identify scientist that will lead to problems when using them to automate scientific reporting.

# 3.2. Features to solve the Autor's identification problem

As Mendeley, a well-established reference management tool, exhibits several strengths and limitations in addressing the author identification challenge in academic research. The system excels in organizing scientific works, offering functionalities for importing, organizing, and searching academic papers. It is adept at automatically formatting citations and bibliographies in numerous styles and syncs libraries across devices and platforms. Mendeley's integration with popular text editors like Microsoft Word and LibreOffice simplifies citation insertion and formatting.

Notably, Mendeley provides robust group work features, allowing shared access to libraries and facilitating collaborative research. Additionally, its web importer tool enables easy importing of articles from various scientific databases and websites directly into the Mendeley library. However, Mendeley shows a significant limitation when it comes to author identification. It lacks an integrated solution for author identification using ORCID identifiers. ORCID provides a unique identifier for researchers, which is crucial for accurately managing publication records and avoiding ambiguities in authorship. This gap in Mendeley's functionality highlights a crucial need in reference management systems — the need for advanced author identification mechanisms that ensure accuracy and efficiency in academic documentation and communication.

Other limitations of Mendeley include the absence of tools for categorizing publications by specific scientific themes or projects, the lack of functionality for academic advancement or accreditation processes, and no validation of user-added publication authenticity. Furthermore, Mendeley's limited free plan, privacy concerns due to its association with Elsevier, occasional stability issues, and the lack of a Google Docs citation module are noted as additional areas for improvement.

In summary, while Mendeley offers a comprehensive suite of features for literature management and academic collaboration, its capa-



bilities in author identification, particularly using digital identifiers like ORCID, indicate a significant area for potential enhancement. Addressing these challenges would markedly improve the scholarly communication and data management efficacy in the academic sector.

# 3.3. Ontological viewpoint

This issue could be used with modern cognitive and ontological tools as they proved their efficiency in solving practical tasks, including science (Dovhyi et al., 2020; Globa, Novogrudskaya et al., 2020; Globa, Sulima et al., 2020; Shapovalov et al., 2022; Shapovalov & Shapovalov, 2021; Stryzhak et al., 2021; Tarasenko et al., 2020; Shapovalov et al., 2018). Previously, Polyhedron -Researcher' was developed at the National Center of Junior Academy of the Sciences of Ukraine. (Prykhodnyuk et al., 2023; Prykhodniuk et al., 2023).

The figure displays a screenshot of an interface for the Polyhedron-Researcher" system, which is described as a feature of the "Polyhedron" project by National Center of Junior Academy of Sciences of Ukraine. This system is part of the "Comprehensive Information-Analytical Platform for Forming Transdisciplinary Information-Analytical Spaces for Young Researchers".

Lest describe the main functions. The interface includes several menu items on the left, suggesting a structured approach to managing publication activities and resources. The main part of the screen provides an overview of the system's modules, which are divided into two major categories: Modules for depicting the current state of publication activity and Modules for depicting knowledge in the field of publication activity.

Under the first category, there are submodules for:

- "Quantifying Publication Activity" likely represents the quantification of researchers' publication outputs.
- "Publication Plan and its Execution" probably allows for planning and tracking publication milestones.
- "Export List of Publications", which suggests a feature for exporting bibliographic data.

- Under the second category, the following submodules are mentioned:
- "Interactive Knowledge Base" which may be a repository of indexed clusters for searching important information.
- "Journals for Publication" and "Conferences for Publication" which could be databases of potential venues for publishing research.
- "Current NAPS", which might provide information about current activities and requirements of the NAPS.
- "Scientific Results Preview" that probably offers a preview of research outcomes.
- "Current State and Decisions", which is likely to be a module for documenting and retrieving decisions and document states.

What is important is that "Quantifying Publication Activity" integrates authors through the links between different forms of the same author's name. That ensures the correct counting of the author's publication. It still does not use ORCID, however, this approach also proved its efficiency, and one of the modules of the 'POLIEDR-Researcher' counts the coefficients of correspondence to attestation criterium (where the function of merging of publication related to same author is required).

Additionally, there is a section for "Data Submission for Entering into IAC", which seems to be a data entry point for researchers to submit information to be integrated into the system. It emphasizes the importance of adhering to a specified format, suggesting automation in handling of data, possibly through Gmail.

## **4. CONCLUSIONS**

This paper has comprehensively examined the capabilities and limitations of various reference manager systems, focusing on their role in addressing the author identification challenge in academic research. Through an extensive literature review and empirical analysis, it was determined that while tools like Zotero, EndNote, Mendeley, SciWheel, and Paperpile offer robust functionalities for reference management, their capabilities in author identification, specifically using digital identifiers like ORCID, are limited or non-existent. This gap is significant, as accurate author identification is crucial for the integrity and efficiency of scholarly communication. The absence of advanced author identification mechanisms, such as the integration of ORCID, in these systems highlights a critical area for future development. Addressing this need is essential not only for enhancing the accuracy of academic documentation but also for supporting the principles of Open Science and FAIR data management. To solve this problem, developing specialized tools or using ontology-based decision is possible.

The findings suggest that future enhancements in reference management systems should prioritize the incorporation of digital identifiers to resolve ambiguities in authorship and improve data management processes. This advancement would significantly contribute to streamlining academic reporting and the automation of scientific documentation, thereby bolstering the efficacy of research and scholarly communication in the digital age.

## REFERENCES

- 1. Bednar, P., Ivancakova, J., & Sarnovsky, M. (2022). Semantic automatization of the data-analytical processes. *2022 IEEE 16th International Symposium on Applied Computational Intelligence and Informatics (SACI)*, 000239–000242. https://doi.org/10.1109/SACI55618.2022.9919438
- Chukanova, S. (2022). The FAIR concept in the context of Open Science. First International Conference "Open Science and Innovation in Ukraine 2022," 72–73. https://doi.org/10.35668/978-966-479-129-5-4-1
- De Bie, T., De Raedt, L., Hernández-Orallo, J., Hoos, H. H., Smyth, P., & Williams, C. K. I. (2021). Automating Data Science: Prospects and Challenges. 65(3), 76–87. https://doi. org/10.1145/3495256
- Dierkes, E., Jung, F., & Büskens, C. (2021). Data-based models of drive technology for automation in automotive production. *Proceedings Applied Mathematics and Mechanics*, 20(1). https://doi.org/10.1002/pamm.202000286
- Dovhyi, S., Stryzhak, O., & Globa, L. (2020). Transdisciplinary Fundamentals of Information-Analytical Activity. Advances in Information and Communication Technology and Systems, MCT 2019. Lecture Notes in Networks and Systems, 152(152), 99–126. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-58359-0\_7
- Durante, M., Indelicato, P., Jonson, B., Koch, V., Langanke, K., Meißner, U.-G., Nappi, E., Nilsson, T., Stöhlker, T., Widmann, E., & Wiescher, M. (2019). All the fun of the FAIR: fundamental physics at the facility for antiproton and ion research. *Physica Scripta*, *94*(3), 033001. https://doi.org/10.1088/1402-4896/aaf93f
- 7. Francavilla, M. L. (2018). Learning, teaching and writing with reference managers. *Pediatric Radiology*, *48*(10), 1393–1398. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00247-018-4175-z
- Globa, L., Novogrudskaya, R., Zadoienko, B., & Stryzhak, O. Y. (2020). Ontological Model for Scientific Institutions Information Representation. *International Conference on Problems of Infocommunications. Science and Technology (PIC S&T)*, 255–258. https://doi.org/10.1109/ PICST51311.2020.9467984
- Globa, L., Sulima, S., Skulysh, M., Dovgyi, S., & Stryzhak, O. Y. (2020). Architecture and Operation Algorithms of Mobile Core Network with Virtualization. *IntechOpen*, *32*, 137–144. http://www.intechopen.com/books/trends-in-telecommunications-technologies/gps-total-electron-content-tec- prediction-at-ionosphere-layer-over-the-equatorial-region%0AInTec
- 10. Hut, R. (2022). FAIR Models. *Groundwater*, 60(3), 309–310. https://doi.org/10.1111/gwat.13180
- 11. latsyshyn, A. V, Popov, O. O., Kovach, V. O., latsyshyn, A. V, Artemchuk, V. O., Radchenko, O. O., Deinega, I. I., & Kovalenko, V. V. (2021). Formation of the scientist image in modern condi-



tions of digital society transformation. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, *1840*(1), 012039. https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1840/1/012039

- 12. Meade, M., DiCiurcio, W., Radack, T., Michael, M., & Woods, B. (2023). Reference Managers. *Clinical Spine Surgery: A Spine Publication*. https://doi.org/10.1097/BSD.00000000001532
- Méndez Fernández, D., Monperrus, M., Feldt, R., & Zimmermann, T. (2019). The open science initiative of the Empirical Software Engineering journal. *Empirical Software Engineering*, 24(3), 1057–1060. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10664-019-09712-x
- Prykhodnyuk, V. V., Gorborukov, V. V., & Franchuk, O. V. (2023). Ontological principles of knowledge management in the context of educational and research activities. Scientific Notes of the Small Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, 3 (28), 62–70. (In Ukraine)
- Prykhodniuk, V. V., Gorborukov, V. V., Shapovalov, E. B., & Savchenko, Ya. V. (2023). The use of information and analytical platforms in the organization of scientific and research activities on an adaptive basis. 2nd International Scientific Forum "Adaptive Processes in Education", 259–261.
- 16. Ramachandran, R., Bugbee, K., & Murphy, K. (2021). From Open Data to Open Science. *Earth and Space Science*, *8*(5). https://doi.org/10.1029/2020EA001562 (In Ukraine)
- 17. Shapovalov, Y. B., Shapovalov, V. B., Tarasenko, R. A., Bilyk, Z., Shapovalova, I., Paschke, A., & Andruszkiewicz, F. (2022). Practical application of systemizing expedition research results in the form of taxonomy. *Educational Technology Quarterly*, *3*, 216–231. https://doi.org/10.55056/etq.40
- Shapovalov, Y. B., & Shapovalov, V. B. V. (2021). A Taxonomic Representation of Scientific Studies. Proceedings of the 17th International Conference on ICT in Education, Research and Industrial Applications. Integration, Harmonization and Knowledge Transfer. Volume I: Main Conference, PhD Symposium, and Posters, 3013, 353–360. http://ceur-ws.org/Vol-3013/20210353.pdf
- Shapovalov, Ye. B., Shapovalov, V. B., Stryzhak, O. E., & Salyuk, A. I. (2018). Use of ontological tools for systematization and analysis of information on waste disposal by methanogenesis. Ecological Safety and Nature Use, 27(3), 68–79. http://es-journal.in.ua/issue/view/9395 (In Ukraine)
- Singha Roy, S., Mercer, R. E., & Urra, F. (2020). Investigating Citation Linkage as a Sentence Similarity Measurement Task Using Deep Learning (pp. 483–495). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-47358-7\_50
- Stryzhak, O., Dovgyi, S., Popova, M., & Chepkov, R. (2021). Transdisciplinary Principles of Narrative Discourse as a Basis for the Use of Big Data Communicative Properties (pp. 258– 273). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-73103-8\_17
- 22. Stryzhak, O. Y. (2020). Taxonomic principles of narrative discourse. *MEDICAL INFORMATICS AND ENGINEERING*, *2*, 137–147. https://doi.org/10.11603/mie.1996-1960.2020.2.11186
- Stryzhak, O. Y., Horborukov, V., Prychodniuk, V., Franchuk, O., & Chepkov, R. (2021). Decision-making System Based on The Ontology of The Choice Problem. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, *1828*(1), 012007–0. https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1828/1/012007
- Tarasenko, R. A., Shapovalov, V. B., Shapovalov, Y. B., Usenko, S. A., Savchenko, I. N., Pachenko, E. U., & Paschke, A. (2020). Comparison of ontology with non-ontology tools for educational research. *Proceedings of the 8th Workshop on Cloud Technologies in Education* (CTE 2020), CEUR, 2879, 82–104. http://ceur-ws.org/Vol-2879/paper02.pdf
- Vicente-Saez, R., & Martinez-Fuentes, C. (2018). Open Science now: A systematic literature review for an integrated definition. *Journal of Business Research*, *88*, 428–436. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2017.12.043
- 26. Wilkinson, M. D., Dumontier, M., Aalbersberg, Ij. J., Appleton, G., Axton, M., Baak, A., Blomberg, N., Boiten, J.-W., da Silva Santos, L. B., Bourne, P. E., Bouwman, J., Brookes, A. J., Clark,

T., Crosas, M., Dillo, I., Dumon, O., Edmunds, S., Evelo, C. T., Finkers, R., ... Mons, B. (2016). The FAIR Guiding Principles for scientific data management and stewardship. *Scientific Data*, *3*(1), 160018. https://doi.org/10.1038/sdata.2016.18

# ПРОБЛЕМИ БІБЛІОГРАФІЧНИХ МЕНЕДЖЕРІВ ДЛЯ АВТОМАТИЗАЦІЇ НАУКИ: ПІДХІД ДО ВИРІШЕННЯ ТА ОНТОЛОГІЧНИЙ ПІДХІД

Анотація. У статті досліджено функціональність та обмеження основних систем менеджменту бібліографічних посилань, з акцентом на їхню роль у вирішенні проблеми ідентифікації авторів у академічних дослідженнях. Аналізуються особливості популярних менеджерів посилань, таких як Zotero, EndNote, Mendeley, SciWheel, та Paperpile, та оцінюються їхні можливості у сфері управління посиланнями та підходи до ідентифікації авторів. Дослідження виявляє, що, незважаючи на міцну функціональність управління посиланнями, існують недоліки у інтеграції просунутих механізмів ідентифікації авторів, як-от ORCID. Відсутність таких функцій підкреслює значний пробіл у сучасних рішеннях управління посиланнями, що впливає на точність та ефективність наукового спілкування. Стаття підкреслює потребу в розширених функціях менеджерів бібліографічних посилань для ефективного вирішення проблем ідентифікації авторів, особливо в контексті Відкритої науки та принципів управління даними FAIR. Дослідження сприяє розумінню поточних обмежень менеджерів бібліографічних посилань та підкреслює важливість розвитку просунутих функцій для точної атрибуції авторів у цифрову епоху академічних досліджень. Зосереджується на використанні додаткових інтеграційних даних про авторів за допомогою ORCID як основного ідентифікатора. Таке рішення є критичним для країн з нелатинським алфавітом, включно з кирилицею.

**Ключові слова:** Відкрита наука; Принципи FAIR; Менеджери посилань; Ідентифікація автора; Цифрові ідентифікатори; Онтологічні інструменти.

#### **INFORMATION ABOUT THE AUTHORS**

- Shapovalova Maryna PhD in Engineering, Senior Researcher, State Scientific and Technical Library of Ukraine, Antonovycha St, 180, Kyiv, 03150; +380987226164; e-mail: shapovalova@dntb.gov.ua; ORCID: 0000-0003-4709-2056
- Shapovalov Viktor Senior Researcher, State Scientific and Technical Library of Ukraine, Antonovycha St, 180, Kyiv, 03150; +380665438481; e-mail: v.shapovalov@dntb.gov.ua; ORCID: 0000-0001-6315-649X
- Shapovalov Yevhenii PhD in Engineering, Senior Researcher Senior Researcher, State Scientific and Technical Library of Ukraine, Antonovycha St, 180, Kyiv, 03150; +380689011575; e-mail: shapovalov.e@dntb.gov.ua; ORCID: 0000-0003-3732-9486

#### ΙΗΦΟΡΜΑЦΙЯ ΠΡΟ ΑΒΤΟΡΙΒ

- Шаповалова Марина кандидатка техічних наук, старший науковий співробітник, Державна науково-технічна бібліотека України, вулиця Антоновича, 180, Київ, 03150; +380987226164; e-mail: shapovalova@ dntb.gov.ua; ORCID: 0000-0003-4709-2056
- Шаповалов Віктор старший науковий співробітник, Державна науково-технічна бібліотека України, вулиця Антоновича, 180, Київ, 03150; +380665438481; e-mail: v.shapovalov@dntb.gov.ua; ORCID: 0000-0001-6315-649X
- Шаповалов Євгеній кандидат техічних наук, старший науковий співробітник, старший дослідник, Державна науково-технічна бібліотека України, вулиця Антоновича, 180, Київ, 03150; +380689011575; e-mail: shapovalov.e@dntb.gov.ua; ORCID: 0000-0003-3732-9486